How to do a good Literature review

Dr. Christoph Stork

Steps in a literature review

1. Search literature
2. Assess relevance for own study
3. Use of literature for own theory and empirical strategy

Searches

Where to search?

- ‣ Reference lists (snow balling)

- ‣ Electronic Bibliographic databases (ScienceDirect, EBSCOhost, Econolit etc.)

- ‣ Search Engines (Google, Google Scholar, Bing, Yahoo...)
  - Peer reviewed journals
  - Grey Literature
  - Conference proceedings

Literature search challenges

- Database Bias: No single database is likely to contain all published studies on a given subject

- English-language bias

- Publication Bias:
  - Negative trials/impacts unpublished
  - Not yet published

- Finding unpublished work: It is important to search for unpublished studies, manual search of conference proceedings, correspondence with experts...

- Citation bias:
  - significant or positive results are referenced in other publications, compared with studies with inconclusive or negative findings
  - Citing a citation of a citation

- Search Term Bias: search terms used omits relevant literature

Search Term Bias: Too few results?

- ‣ Take some time to read through search instructions if available

- ‣ Use of "and" "or" "+" differs from site to site

- ‣ Use truncated words where applicable
  - countries and country different but both show for "countr"

- ‣ Don't forget synonyms
  - MTR, mobile termination rates, interconnection

Example:

▸ (agricultur* or rural or farm* or smallhold* or "micro entrepreneur*" or "micro enterprise*" or microentrepreneur* or microenterprise* or microbusiness* or "micro business*" or "small business*" or Grower* or "non-grower*" or "agri trade*" or agritrade* or "first-handler*" or intermediar* or middleman or middlemen)

▸ (((mobile* or cell or cellular or smart or digital) adj (phone* or telephon* or network* or technology or application* or Tablet*)) or cellphone* or smartphone* or ICT)

Assess relevance for own study

Search Engine Examples

- "Impact of mobile phones on poverty"
    - Google
    - Google Scholar
    - Science Direct

ScienceDirect

All fields [Impact of mobile phones on po]   Author [   ]

Journal/Book title [   ]   Volume [   ] Issue [   ] Page [   ]   [Search]

1,433 articles found for: ALL(Impact of mobile phones on poverty)   💾 Save this search | 🔖 Save as search alert | 📶 RSS Feed

Go to page: [1] of 58 [Go] | Next

Purchase | ✉ E-mail articles | ⮞ Export citations | Open all previews   Sort by: **Relevance** | Date

Search within results

[   ] [Search]

Refine results

[Limit to] [Exclude]

Publication

☐ Journal (1,226)
☐ Book (218)
☐ Reference Work (37)

Journal/Book Title

☐ Telecommunications Policy (62)
☐ World Development (55)
☐ Social Science & Medicine (46)
☐ Energy Policy (34)
☐ Geoforum (31)

view more ⊞

Topic

☐ internet (52)
☐ india (44)

1 ☐ **Deprivation, distance and connectivity: The adaptation of mobile phone use to a life in Wesbank, a post-apartheid**   For purchase
township in South Africa Original Research Article
Discourse, Context & Media, Volume 1, Issue 4, December 2012, Pages 203-216
Fie Velghe

↓ Show preview | 📄 Purchase PDF - $31.50 | Recommended articles | Related reference work articles

Highlights

► We examine mobile phone use of women in an impoverished community in South Africa. ► Society and technologies are dialectically
related. ► Socio-economic circumstances shape the technology as much as vice versa. ► Mobile phones create new opportunities with
regards to safety, identity, and contact. ► Poverty puts a major constraint on the full potential.

2 ☐ **Creating space for innovation—The case of mobile telephony in MSEs in Ghana** Original Research Article   For purchase
Technovation, Volume 31, Issue 12, December 2011, Pages 679-688
George Owusu Essegbey, Godfred Kwasi Frempong

↓ Show preview | 📄 Purchase PDF - $31.50 | Recommended articles | Related reference work articles

Highlights

► The mobile phone is a tool for business innovation. ► Innovation is central to socio-economic development. ► Policy action is vital
to facilitate innovation.

Google

Impact of mobile phones on poverty   ▼   🔍

Scholar

About 48,900 results (**0.10** sec)

[PDF] The role of **mobile phones** in sustainable rural **poverty** reduction
A Bhavnani, RWW Chiu, S Janakiram, P Silarszky... - retrieved ..., 2008 - i-gov.org
... are highly paid and sought after, and there is a major knock-on **effect** in retail ... 12: Contribution to Employment from the **Mobile** Value Chain Source: Deloitte, Economic **Impact** of **Mobile** in ... Deloitte (2008) categorized the productivity benefits of **mobile phones** into five broad areas: ...
Cited by 71   Related articles   All 11 versions   Cite   More ▾

Mobile phones and economic development in Africa
J Aker, I Mbiti - Center for Global Development Working Paper, 2010 - papers.ssrn.com
... Careful **impact** evaluations of **mobile phone** development projects are required to better understand their **impacts** upon economic and social outcomes, and ... time, by the entire world. These **effects** can be particularly dramatic in rural Africa, where in many places **mobile** ...
Cited by 209   Related articles   All 38 versions   Cite

[BOOK] Village pay **phones** and **poverty** reduction: Insights from a Grameen Bank initiative in Bangladesh
A Bayes, J Von Braun, R Akhter - 1999 - opengrey.eu
... Grameen Bank (GB) of Bangladesh, the village-based micro-finance organization, leased cellular **mobile phones** to successful ... GB calls these **phones** Village Pay **Phones** (VPPs ... VPPs also seems to have perceptible and positive **effects** on the empowerment and social status of ...
Cited by 130   Related articles   Cite   More ▾

Mobile phones and economic development: Evidence from the fishing industry in India
R Abraham - ... Technologies and Development, 2006. ICTD'06. ..., 2006 - ieeexplore.ieee.org
... The network externalities3 associated with ICTs implied that positive growth **effects** might be subject to ... telephony has a positive and significant **impact** on economic growth, and this **impact** may be ... 3 Network externalities refer to the **effect** that certain products increase in value as ...
Cited by 148   Related articles   All 9 versions   Cite

[PDF] Mobile **Cell Phones** and **Poverty** Reduction: Technology Spending
www.w3.org/2008/02/MS4D_WS/.../position_paper-diga-2008pdf.pdf ▾
The **mobile phone** can have the greatest **effects** on **poverty** reduction during
vulnerable shock experiences through driving down costs associated to the shock.

Cell Phones, Microfinance, and **Poverty** | Acton PowerBlog
blog.acton.org/.../52721-**cell-phones**-microfinance-and-**poverty**.html ▾
Apr 4, 2013 - In an interview with **PovertyCure**, he explains causes of **poverty**: Being
poor ... **Mobile phones** have made a huge **impact** in places like Kenya.

Kenya's telecom revolution and the **impact of mobile** money ...
blogs.worldbank.org/.../kenya-s-telecom-revolution-and-the-**impact-of**-... ▾
Dec 3, 2010 - Among the many uses of **cell phones**, the most innovative is mobile
money— money ... in-depth analysis of the socio-economic **impacts of mobile** money.
... be able to lift Africans from **poverty** and bring about lasting prosperity.

[PDF] the role of **mobile phones** in sustainable rural **poverty** reduction
siteresources.worldbank.org/.../The_Role_of_**Mobile_Phones**_in_Sustain... ▾
by A Bhavnani - 2008 - Cited by 71 - Related articles
Jun 15, 2008 - depth studies which have been carried out to document the **impact** of the
mobile phones on economic development and on sustainable **poverty** ...

Group Work

- ‣ Operationalise poverty : income, health, hunger...

- ‣ Work through extracts: first 50 hits of Google, Google Scholar and Science Direct

- ‣ How are the 3 search results different?
  - How many excluded?
  - How many included?
  - How many cannot tell from abstract?

	Google	Google Scholar	Science Direct
Included			
Excluded			
Cannot Tell			
How many included are the same three sources			

Abstract evaluation check List

	Test	Action
Empirical investigation	Yes	continue to next step
	?	get full paper
	No	exclude - stop checklist
Dependent Variable "Income"	Yes	continue to next step
	?	get full paper
	No	exclude - stop checklist
Independent variable include mobile ownership or mobile use	Yes	continue to next step
	?	get full paper
	No	exclude - stop checklist
Uses Regression model	Yes	continue to next step
	?	get full paper
	No	exclude - stop checklist

Literature use

Literature review with a purpose

1. Highlight what has been covered by others or demonstrate that relevant literature was considered
2. Basis for own theory and empirical models

   - a) In-depth review

   - b) extracting effect sizes

   - c) evaluating the arguments made

1) Highlight what has been covered by others

‣ Example Klonner & Nolen (2008):

   Klonner and Nolen (2008) find that if a municipality is going from 0% to 100% coverage there will be an increased employment of 33.7% in the following year.

2a) Use for own theory and modelling

‣ Klonner and Nolen (2008) analyse the impact of mobile network roll-out on household income and employment status in rural South Africa using household and labour force survey data from the national statistical offices (StatsSA). The data, which is collected for census enumerator areas (EAs) is mapped to coverage data from Vodacom.

  ‣ Klonner and Nolen (2008) merge the October Household Survey (OHS) from 1996, 1997 and 1998 with the September Labour Force Survey for 2000 and 2001, thus creating a municipal panel over 5 years. All individuals from the household survey that were in the labour market were included in the data set. Klonner and Nolen (2008) avoid the problem of larger households effecting the results by clustering the standard errors at a level above the household to account for the correlation of employment within the household.

  ‣ In total 88 models are tested using OLS and instrumental variables. Fixed effects dummies were used to take into account unobserved factors for placement of base stations, while an instrumental variable is constructed reflecting topographical factors under the assumption that topography would be an important factor for the roll out of a network. The roll out of networks depends on many factors and topography may only be one of them and unlikely to be an important one at the beginning of network roll out. The IV for topography may thus not be ideal. The initial roll out was in urban areas and along national highways, as can be seen from Figure 2 on page 22. Klonner and Nolen (2008) safeguard, however, that the IV picked up exogenous factors that predicted roll out.

  ‣ Another potential limitation could be that at the time of the survey there were two mobile operators that even in 2013 have a slightly different network footprint. MTN and Vodacom at that time were roughly of the same size, yet only Vodacom's network was incorporated. A rural area in a municipality may thus have been classified as not covered (by Vodacom) while it actually had coverage through MTN. The lack of data from MTN can be considered a measurement error. The IV is, however, robust to measurement error as pointed out by Klonner and Nolen (2008).

  ‣ A third potential concern is the clustering by municipality. The sampling done by StatsSA is representative nationally and for provinces and districts but not for municipalities. The randomly selected enumerator areas (EAs) within a municipality in one year may thus be very different from those randomly selected in the next. South Africa has among the highest Gini coefficients in the world which is also reflected in where people live within a municipal area, rural as well as urban areas.

  ‣ Klonner and Nolen (2008) ran regressions at the district level as well to confirm that this would not have an impact.

  ‣ Klonner and Nolen (2008) find that if a municipality is going from 0% to 100% coverage there will be an increased employment of 33.7% in the following year. Applied to this specific case a 15 percentage point increase in employment, on average, for rural areas that had cellular coverage during the period of 1997 until 2001. Ideally the models would be re run with MTN coverage included to reduce the measurement error.

research**ICT**africa**.net**

2b) Extracting Effect sizes
Example: Klonner & Nolen (2008)

Table 4. Analysis of Individual Employment, Extensive Margin

VARIABLES	Dependent Variable: person is employed									
	COLUMNS									
	[1]	[2]	[3]	[4]	[5]	[6]	[7]	[8]	[9]	[10]
Coverage in the MD in the year before	0.047***	0.337***	0.025	0.053	0.080***	0.447***	0.078**	0.278*	0.081**	0.642***
	[0.017]	[0.102]	[0.023]	[0.106]	[0.024]	[0.111]	[0.035]	[0.160]	[0.033]	[0.156]
Dummy Variable =1 if Person is Male	0.100***	0.100***								
	[0.004]	[0.004]								
Dummy Variable =1 if Person is White	-0.005	-0.003	-0.02	-0.02	0.062**	0.061**	0.062*	0.061*	0.103**	0.101*
	[0.016]	[0.016]	[0.020]	[0.020]	[0.028]	[0.028]	[0.035]	[0.035]	[0.051]	[0.052]
Dummy Variable =1 if Person is Coloured	0.030*	0.028	0.036	0.035	0.018	0.017	0.026	0.027	0.005	0.004
	[0.018]	[0.018]	[0.022]	[0.022]	[0.030]	[0.030]	[0.038]	[0.038]	[0.052]	[0.053]
Municipality Fixed Effects	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
District * Year Fixed Effects	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
District Coverage * Population Density, Percent Male, Percent White, Percent Coloured and Avg Household Size in MD in 1996	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Constant	0.683***	0.595	0.879***	0.789***	1.234***	1.191***	0.458*	0.862***	0.690*	1.518***
	[0.134]	[0.662]	[0.184]	[0.203]	[0.202]	[0.215]	[0.275]	[0.279]	[0.376]	[0.317]
Observations	57486	57486	28264	28264	29222	29222	14105	14105	15117	15117
R-squared	0.26		0.279		0.242		0.265		0.239	
Standard errors in brackets										
* significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%										
[1] OLS Results for entire sample; [2] IV results for entire sample; [3] OLS Results for Males; [4] IV resutls for Males; [5] and [6] OLS and IV results, respectively, for females; [7] and [8] OLS and IV results for Women living in households with less than two children; [9] and [10] OLS and IV results for women living in households with 3 children or more.										

	Mobile Coverage				
Author	**Dependent variable**		**Observations**	**Effect Size**	**Standard Error**
Jensen (2007)	Max-Min spread of prices between market		74,700	-5 Rs	0.27
	coefficient of variation price spread			-0.38	0.03
	Waste reduction			-0.048	0.0004
Klonner and Nolen (2008)	Additional likelihood of a person being employed one year after coverage		57486	33.7%	0.102
Aker (2010)	Price dispersion for millet: absolute value of the price differences between market pairs for each month		53,820	16%, 3.51 CFA/kg	0.645
Aker and Fafchamps (2011)	Price dispersion for cowpeas measured as absolute value of the differences between in logs of producer prices of two markets		39,120	6.3%	-0.007
	Price dispersion for cowpeas measured as difference in Max-Min spread of prices between two markets		2503	50%	0.105
	Price dispersion for cowpeas measured as difference in coefficient of variation between two markets		39,120	6%	0.14
Beuermann et al (2012)	Effect sizes for 6 years of coverage compared to no	wage income (log)	40,000	0.34	0.043
		expenditure (log)		0.446	0.073

2c) Evaluating Arguments made

‣ 2 Components:

- 1) Premise

- 2) Conclusion

‣ Valid arguments:

- It is not possible for the premises to be true and the conclusion to be false

Validity: example 1

1. All oak trees have roots (true)
2. All trees in England have roots (true)

_____

Some oak trees grow in England (true)

Is the argument valid?

Validity: example 1

1. All oak trees have roots (true)
2. All trees in Fiji have roots (true)

_____

Some oak trees grow in Fiji (false)

If conclusion can be wrong despite premises being true than we have an invalid argument

Validity: example 2

1. Oak trees only grow in places where it rains with some degree of regularity (true)
2. It does not rain in the Sahara with some degree of regularity (true)

_____

Oak trees do not grow in the Sahara (true)

conclusion cannot be wrong while premises are true = valid argument

Validity: example 3

1. All fish swim (true)
2. All whale swim (true)

_____

Whales are fish (false)

Validity: example 4

1. If the Earth is round, then many things would just fall off the Earth (false)
2. Things do not just fall off the Earth (true)

_____

The Earth is not round (false)

Validity: example 5

1. If you go out, you will get wet
2. You dont want to get wet

_____

Do not go out

We cannot say whether it is valid or not.

Advice may be useful or not if it rains and there is no umbrella...

Reference List

‣ Literature review has too parts: body and reference list

‣ Decide on style before writing: APA, Harvard

‣ Best to maintain reference list while you get along. If you wait until the end you may struggle to find references again

research**ICT**africa**.net**

Questions?